

Impact of Effective Wages and Salary Administration on Civil Service Productivity in Nigeria: A Study of Anambra State

Okeke, Patrick Anene¹, Nwele, James Obasi² and Achilike, Nicholas I³

¹Department of Business Administration, Renaissance University, Ugbawka – Enugu, Nigeria.

²Department of Business Administration, Renaissance University, Ugbawka – Enugu, Nigeria.

³Director, Research, Planning and Development, School of Business and Legal Studies, Abakaliki, Nigeria.

³Department of Business Administration, Renaissance University, Ugbawka – Enugu, Nigeria.

Article Received: 23 August 2017

Article Accepted: 23 November 2017

Article Published: 14 December 2017

ABSTRACT

This study examined the impact of effective wages and salary administration on civil service productivity in Nigeria using Anambra State as case study. As a descriptive survey design, an item structured instrument developed to reflect the modified 5 points Likert Scale format was used to elicit information from the respondents. The population consisted of 2951 Civil Servants from which a sample of 557 respondents was selected, using a formula developed by Borg and Gall (1973). Whereas percentages and mean ratings were used to answer the research questions, Chi-square (χ^2) test of independence and T- test for independent large sample, ($n > 30$) were used to test the hypotheses. The study revealed that employees need effective salary and wages administration to achieve high productivity in the civil service. The study found also that poor leadership and lack of political will were the major reasons for not fully implementing the minimum wage policy by some state governments including Anambra State. The study recommends that the government should take the issue of wages and salary administration serious by giving workers a living wage to enable them take care of their basic needs and be better positioned for enhanced productivity and output level in civil service.

Keywords: Effective Wages and Salary Administration, Civil Service, Productivity, Anambra State, Nigeria.

1.0 Introduction

1.1 Background of the Study

In any organization, be it in the private or public sector, money is a very sensitive issue, not only to management but also to employees (Nwachukwu, 2009). Wages and salaries constitute a significant part of the total cost of operation in any organization or establishment. In some organizations, such as civil/ public service, they make up more than 50 percent of operating costs. In the organized private sector, large organization's ability to attract and retain valuable employees in part depends largely on how much the pay. Poor wages are a constant source of frustration if labour and management are engaged in constant strife with resulting decrease in productivity (Nwachukwu, 2009).

Wages administration in Nigeria is as old as civil service itself. Many administration have come and gone but not without deliberating on what constitutes the appropriate or minimum wage or salary of civil servants should be. In some situation, it has been without industrial disputes, especially during the military era while most of the civilian regimes were dominated by trade disputes initiated by major labour centers in the country (Obiora, 2013). Sometimes, the crises arising from such dispute leads to break down of law and order, especially when they are hijacked by miscreants in the society. Workers, through their labour representatives have always asked for improved conditions of services and can go to any length to press home their demands.

To Egbo and Okeke (2009), salaries and wages of civil servants are not left to the discretion of employers. They are usually backed by a legal instrument stating the minimum pay for workers. For instance, the Obasanjo led government in 2003 pegged the minimum wage rate for federal workers at N7,500.00. It was initiated through

rigorous consultations between worker's representatives and the government, before the wages and fiscal commission forwarded the agreement to the National Assembly for necessary legal backing. Nigeria being a federal structure, it was expected that the federating states should fix the salaries and wages of their workers. However, what has happened over the years is that the state workers representatives (labour unions) through the joint public service Negotiating council (JPSNC), usually adopt the Federal Government's rate of federal workers to engage their respective state governments in negotiating for their workers and this has always created problems in the system. However, some states, especially those from the oil producing area often adopt the federal rate as soon as it is announced, many other states often allege that their allocations from the federation Account cannot sustain such rates and this becomes a good reason for the state workforce to embark on an indefinite strike action. For instance, in Anambra State like many other states of the federation, the problems caused by federal government's 2011 minimum wage pronouncement are still being felt very strongly as the prolonged industrial dispute over the minimum wage pitched the workers against the government thereby making the work environment very un-conducive with negative implications for productivity and output in the sector. According to Nwokolo (2011), such poor labour-management relations affects productivity severely as workers assume that the government does not appreciate their efforts by refusing to pay them federal government rate after all, everybody buy from the same market.

Trade dispute is an evil wind that blows nobody any good. Therefore, every effort must be made always to avoid it. It must however be understood that when workers are not properly treated as ought to, they will not only be demoralized but will also exhibit some negative behaviours in the workplace. Such corrupt practices manifesting in embezzlement, misappropriation of public funds as the feeling of insecurity overwhelms them. They start to steal public funds to take care of the present and also ensure that during retirement, they have enough to fall back on. There is no doubt that an effective and efficient state civil/public service makes every other sector of the state economy vibrant by facilitating the desired development that will impact positively on the quality of life of the citizenry. It is on this note that this study examines the impact of effective wages administration on civil service productivity in Anambra state.

1.2 Statement of the problem

Wages and salary administration in Nigeria is as old as the civil service itself (Olaleye A.O. 2012). Nigeria operates a federal structure in which the states constitute the federal units. On issues of salaries and wages, the minimum wage is on the exclusive list of the federal government. The implication of this is that when the federal government fixes the minimum wage, the federating states are expected to take a queue from that and do likewise for the state civil servants Nwokolo J.I, (2011). But contrary to this expectation, many state governments including Anambra State have always claimed that they don't have the financial capacity to pay the minimum wage fixed by the federal government. The consequence of such actions has always been industrial actions of large proportion by the workers with negative implications for productivity and output Olaleye A.O. (2012). In the light of the above, it has become

necessary to investigate the impact of the effective wage administration in the productivity of civil service and also to examine the constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by state governments in Nigeria.

1.3 Objectives of the study

The broad objective of the study is to examine the impact of effective wages administration on civil service productivity in Nigeria using Anambra State Civil Service as case study. However, the specific objectives of the study are to examine:

- i) The relationship between wages administration and employee performance in the civil service.
- ii) The constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by state governments in Nigeria.

1.4 Research Questions

The following research questions were considered very germane to the study and therefore they were raised to guide the study.

- i) How significant is the relationship between effective wages administration in Civil service and employee's performance?
- ii) What are the constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by some states in Nigeria?

1.5 Research Hypotheses

The following null hypotheses were formulated to guide the study:

- i) The relationship between effective wages administration in civil service and employee's performance is not significant.
- ii) There is no significant difference in the opinion of the respondents regarding what constitutes constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by some state governments in Nigeria.

1.6 Significance of the study

The findings and the recommendations there after of this study will be of immense benefit to the government and in particular the government of Anambra State where the study is taking place. This is because, the relationship between the government and the workers through their representatives (labour unions), would be strengthened and made more cordial by the report. Both government and the unions will see the need to always jaw-jaw- that war-war because, all over the world, dialogue has become the most effective means of settling disagreement even among nations or regions. This is with the understanding that harmonious co-existence would lead to improved productivity and output in civil service.

2.1 Review of related literature

Past works relating to the subject matter of this study were reviewed in this section of the study. The review was carried out under the following sub heading: conceptual reviews, relationship between effective wages

administration and the employees performance in the civil service, perceived constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by some state government in Nigeria, theoretical framework and empirical review.

2.2 Conceptual Review

Wages administration like many other concepts in the social and behavioural or managerial sciences has been given a variety of definition. This is because most literature on the concept sees authors defining it from their various world views. However, within the context of this study, wage administration simply put, means the management of human resources with respect to salary payment to workers when services are rendered. In keeping with their own side of the contract, employers endeavour to pay their workers. The implication is that there exist a contractual agreement between workers and the employer. The way and manner the wages or salaries are paid determines to a large extent the performance of the employees.

In the opinion of Manadhar (2005), there are levels to public service (civil service) wages, namely, reservation wage, efficiency wage and capitation wage. Reservation is given on opportunistic event, efficiency is fixed far and above the opportunistic wages while capitation is deliberately made very low because it is presumed that employees make extra income through corrupt practices. This presumption has not passed through any test for authentication. Therefore, it can as well be regarded as a sweeping generalization.

On the other hand, the term civil service is normally used when referring to the body of men and women employed in a civil capacity and non-political career basis by the federal and state governments, primarily to render and faithfully give effect to their decisions and implementations, (Pinlaiye, 2001). Such career officers normally derive their appointment from the civil service commission, which also exercises power of delegating duties and responsibilities to department in accordance with laid down rules. Adamolekun (2002) states that the civil service is commonly used as the synonym of the machinery of the government, especially in Britain and most common wealth nations of sub-saharan Africa. In the British conception, the civil service is used to refer to the body of permanent officials appointed to assist the decision makers. The civil service can also be seen as a complex organization with a body of seemingly permanent officials appointed in a capacity to assist the political executives in the formulation, execution and implementation of the government policies in ministries and extra ministerial departments within which the specific government works are carried out.

2.3 Relationship between effective wages administration and employees performance in civil service

Anambra State just like any other states in Nigeria, has witnessed series of wage increases in her civil service at different times. However, due to the fact that such increases hardly meet the needs of the beneficiaries, there have always been agitations for more increases to reflect the economic realities of the time.

The relationship between proper remuneration of workers and their efficiency is not farfetched so also are effective leadership and productivity. In many occasions that workers representatives and the government have had to

negotiate wages and salary, in most cases, the executive arm of government both at the state and federal levels have always been represented by certain persons with the understanding that any decision reached in such engagements would be binding on all parties (Adeboy, 2004). This brings the issue of leadership into focus. Leadership essentially determines whether agreements would be implemented and sustained or not. As Tannebaun and Warren (1983) had noted, a leader is always in-charge of the affairs of his subjects. He does not only influence their behaviour but also ensures that the environment is conducive for the achievement of common goal. This, they noted further, is against the realities that restricts use of the leader's authority, prestige or power to diminish the interest of the subordinates thereby exerting her influence.

Generally, incentives are regarded as variable payments made to employees or a group of employees on the basis of the amount of output or results achieved. Alternatively, it could be payments made with the aim of pushing employees' performance towards higher targets (Banjoko, 2006). He noted further that effective incentive pay system is a necessary condition for individual employees and work teams to contribute effectively to the organization, not only in what they do but also in how well they do it. The implication of this is that the organization's overall performance depends to a large degree on the productivity of individuals and groups within the organization. In the opinion of Martocchio (2006), to attract, retain and motivate highly productive workers and to be fair to all employees, an organization needs to reward employees on the basis of their relative productivity. Therefore the link between employee's performance and good pay has been underscored by the above opinion. Reilly (2003) also lent substantial support to the above opinion when he noted that when workers are paid commensurable to their outputs, it does not only encourage them to do more but serves also as a stabilizing force within work environment thereby providing conducive atmosphere for higher productivity. In a related development, Lawal and Oluwatoyin (2011) observes that isolating a worker for reward in civil service may not be as easy as it could be in the private sector, but workers can be effectively motivated, collectively, through prompt implementation of general increase in wages and salaries such as minimum wage issue.

They concluded by noting that refusal to implement minimum wage by the state governments for any reason, often elicit serious negative workplace behaviours which include absenteeism, lateness to work, general poor performance by the workers among others. More often than not, it has led also to prolonged industrial dispute between labour and government.

2.4 Perceived Constraints to full Implementation of Minimum Wage by some State Governments

Minimum wage issue is properly situated in wage administration in the civil service. Even though Nigeria is operating a federal structure which presupposes that each of the federal states ought to fix the wages and salaries of their respective state civil service, the federal government has deliberately allowed the minimum wage to remain in the exclusive legislative list of the government despite all the agitations and protests by the state government to pull it out to the concurrent legislative list. Perhaps, the reason for this gesture could be to forestall unnecessary labour exploitation by paying wages that are below the accepted minimum standard. This apparently, has been the

standpoint of many trade unions that have dared to challenge their state governments over non-implementation of minimum wage.

Many reasons have been advanced by the state governments for not fully implementing the minimum wage as proposed by the federal government. Among such reasons are lean and inadequate financial allocation from the federal government as alleged by the state governments as their major reasons. But more realistically, the problem appears to border more on weak leadership and corrupt practices. According to Obiora (2012), financial resources meant to finance government programmes are often siphoned away by corrupt leaders in Nigeria. Therefore, it is not necessarily a case of corruption which of course has been the bane of Nigerian nation.

According to Kotter (1990) and Coleman (2000), leadership and management are related but not the same. A person can be a manager or a leader but they differ in how they create an agenda, develop a rationale for achieving the agenda and executive plans and also in the types of outcome they achieve. For example, when executing plans, a manager focuses more on monitoring results, comparing them with goals and correcting deviations. In contrast, the leader focuses on energizing people to overcome bureaucratic hurdles to help reach goals. So, it follows that when an individual monitors the performance of his employees, he is playing the role of a manager. However, when he inspires them to work harder at achieving goals, he is a leader. This perhaps, is what is lacking in Nigeria's search for good leadership over the years.

Wages and salaries have never been fixed in such a way that they can sustain the basic or minimum requirements of a civil servant in Nigeria yet many state governments pretends not to have the capacity to pay the meager sum. The worst of it all is that before any wage or salary increase is approved for workers, so much noise would have been made about it and prices of goods and services would have gone up in response to the contemplated salary increase thereby rendering such salary worthless when paid eventually.

Apart from weak leadership and corruption another problem that appears to be preventing the state government from full implementation of minimum wage is the over bloated size of the civil service Nwachukwu C.C (2009). In an attempt to provide jobs for the unemployed to fulfill election promises, government employ more than they actually need for efficient service delivery with the consequences of enlarged wage bill and inefficiency. According to Lawal and Oluwatoyin (2011), there is redundancy and inefficiency in civil service, many staff that collects salary from the government every month do not have schedule of duty. Some don't even have desk and chairs yet their names are on the payroll of one ministry or the other. There is also the issue of ghost worker syndrome which is often perfected with the connivance of a very senior officer of the rank of director or even permanent secretary. All over the world, even in the emerging economies, the duty of the government in reducing mass unemployment is to create enabling environment for the private sector to create jobs and not to get involved in direct employment as obtains in Nigeria. Individuals can be empowered to be self-employed and even create jobs for others. The issue is that there are many sources through which government funds are filtered away on things that are not beneficial to

the generality of the people. As noted by Obiorha (2012), the huge sum of money paid out by the governors to their godfathers is a serious drain on public funds.

Achebe (1983, was perhaps right when, he noted that the problem of Nigeria is bad leadership. Though Nigeria is blessed abundantly with human and natural resources, the missing link has been to have the right person at the helm of affairs of the nation and every other thing will fall into place. It is bad leadership that makes the government to renege on agreements reached at negotiations with labour representatives during implementation. It must be noted that workers are motivated by money more than anything else, especially in this part of the world where majority of the people are still grappling with how to meet basic needs of life.

2.5 Theoretical Framework

The theory upon which this work was anchored is the Maslow's Hierarchy of needs. It is a very widely applied theory in human resource management Human resource is the most dynamic of all productive resources in an organization. Essentially, this implies that organizations must as a matter of necessity recognizes the crucial nature and position human resource occupy in achieving organizational goals.

In literature, the first major attempt to explain the phenomenon of motivation followed systematic conceptual model of human motivation propounded in 1943 by Abraham Maslow. In his book "motivation and personality" published in 1954, Maslow observed that people are generally wanting beings who always possess innate grabbing instinct depending on what they already have. The three core propositions of the theory are:

- ❖ First, human beings have many needs that are different in nature, ranging from biological needs at the lower level to psychological needs at the upper extreme.
- ❖ Second, individuals are in constant state of motivation, never achieving a state of satisfaction except for a very short time; and
- ❖ Third, there needs are arranged in a Hierarchical order, so that the lowest level needs must be satisfied before higher level needs arise or motivate people (Maslow, 1970).

Following from this theoretical exposition, it becomes obvious that the unsatisfied needs can and do influence the behaviour of a person to act in a manner that does not promote the objective of his organization. The success of any organization depends largely on the efficiency and effectiveness of the employees. Motivation assures and propels workers to increase their productivity. Civil servants can be motivated by giving them enhanced salary package that can take care of their need as identified by Maslow in his work.

Even though Maslow's Hierarchy of needs theory was criticized on many grounds by the likes of Alderfer (1972), Bass (1981) and Drucker (1974), it was found very suitable for analyzing the Phenomenon under investigation. The civil service by its very nature is structured to pass through career progression and at each stage up the ladder, the

level of need changes to a higher one in line with Maslow's postulation. For instance, the need for a new entrant into the service is not the same as that of a director. When the workers needs are identified and attended to accordingly, the civil servants would try to be at their best in terms of performance.

2.6 Empirical Review

The results of past studies indicate that low productivity and inefficiency has characterized the public sector organizations in Nigeria since post independence era (Mbogu, 2001, Ezulike, 2001. Heriohanma, 2006); and findings from other studies have equally revealed that the low productivity and inefficiency associated with Nigeria's public servants could be removed if they are provided with some financial incentives, (Tongo, 2005). Perry, Mesch and Paarlberg (2006) undertook a review of pay for performance research which was part of a study on motivation in the public sector. The study concluded that individual financial incentives are ineffective in the traditional public sector settings and joined prior reviews of pay for performance systems in concluding that the effectiveness of financial incentives is dependent on organizational conditions of service. Some researchers among who are Perry (2009) found that respondents perceived increase in wages as a form of confidence that management places on them, and therefore were motivated to improve on their performance. In a study commissioned and undertaken by Olaleye (2012) on the implications of non implementation of minimum wage in Ekiti State by the state government. It was found from the study that apart from the industrial action that often follow such actions and the productivity lose, employee turnover are sometimes observed if the dispute becomes a prolonged one. The study found also that financial resources with which to implement such increases have never been lacking as the government have always alleged rather the problem has been that of lack of will to implement the policy as well as stealing from public funds by those in custody of such funds.

3.1 Research Methodology

In this section, all the methods and procedures adopted in carrying out this study were discussed. The discussion was done under the following subheadings; research design, populations of the study, sample and sampling technique, instrument of the study, validity and reliability of the instrument, methods of data collection and analysis.

3.2 Research Design

A descriptive survey design was used in carrying out this study. As a plan for research project, it provided us with guidelines which directed the researcher toward solving the research problem. As Nwana (1981) puts it, research design is a term \ used to describe a number of decisions which need to be taken regarding the collection of data before ever the data are collected.

3.3 Population of the Study

The population for the study consists of Anambra State civil servants including those whose establishments have not been scheduled but are drawing salaries and wages from the government of Anambra State. However, for

convenient sake, the population was stratified into scheduled and unscheduled staff. Example of the unscheduled government establishments are the Anambra State Printing Press (National Light Newspapers), Anambra State Transport Corporation, Water Corporation, etc. on the other hand the scheduled are the core ministries in the state. Two Thousand Nine Hundred and Fifty One (2951) Senior Staff of these two categories of workers were indentified for the purposes of this study. That is, 1918 of the scheduled staff and 1033 of unscheduled staff.

3.4 Sample and Sampling Technique

We adopted the formula propounded by Borg and Gall in 1973 in determining the sample size for the study as follows:

$$n = (Zx)^2 (e)(N)$$

Where:

n = sample size to be determined

N = entire population of interest

e = X = 0.05

Zx = standard score corresponding to a given Confidence level eg, 95% = 1.96

Substituting we have

$$\begin{aligned} n &= (1.96)^2 (0.05) (2951) \\ &= 3.8416 (147.55) \\ &= 556.8 \\ &= 557 \text{ (Nearest whole number)} \end{aligned}$$

Table 1: Population and Sampling Allocation

S/N	Population Description	Number	Sample Allocation	Percentage of Total
1	Schedule staff	1918	362	65.0
2	Unscheduled Staff	1033	195	35.0
	Total	2951	557	100

Source: Field Survey, 2015

Concerning the technique we used in selecting the sampling units (Civil Servants), systematic sampling technique was considered most appropriate and therefore it was used due to its ability to produce the desire spread in the sample.

3.5 Instrument of the Study

An item structured instrument developed by the researcher in a Likert scale format of strongly agree, agree, disagree, strongly disagree and undecided was used to elicit information from the respondents. The instrument covered the two research questions raised to guide the study.

3.6 Validity and Reliability of the Instrument

The instrument was validated by giving copies of it to my supervisor and other lecturers knowledgeable in questionnaire drafting for comments and criticisms. All the corrections made were reflected in the final draft of the instrument. Concerning the reliability of the instrument, the researcher used a test retest method in establishing the reliability of the instrument. It involved administering 22 copies of the instrument on some civil servants outside sample. After an interval of two weeks, the instrument was administered on the same people a second time and the first and second responses were analyzed through the application of spearman rank order correlation coefficient. The result showered 0.81 and 0.89 respectively for research questions 1 and 2 thus, showing average coefficient of 0.85. The implication of this is that the instrument is 85% reliable.

3.7 Methods of Data Collection and Analysis

We used direct questionnaire distribution approach. The approach afforded the researcher the opportunity of making clarifications or explanations where necessary. It also reduced the level of non- response which often associates with surveys of this nature. Out of the 557 questionnaire issued out, 457 were completed and returned that is 320 of the scheduled staff and 137 of unscheduled staff thus showing a response rate of 82% which we considered adequate for the study.

The major tools of analysis were percentages and mean rating which were used to answer the research questions and chi-squares (X^2) test of independence as well as t- test for independent large sample that is, ($n \geq 30$), which were used to test the hypothesis. All tests were carried out at 0.05 level of significance.

3.8 Presentation of Data and Analysis

In this section, the data which were gathered in likert scale format were analyzed to respond to the research questions as well as test the hypotheses formulated to guide the study. All test were done at 0.05 level of significance. This is the probability at which we were willing to risk type 1 error.

3.9 Analysis of Research Questions

Research Question One:

This research question is concerned with the relationship between effective wages administration in the civil service and employees performance. The responses from the respondents were presented in Table 2 below.

Table 2: Relationship between Effective Wages Administration in Civil Service and Employees' Performance

S/N	ITEM	Alternative Response					
		SA	A	D	SD	UND	TOTAL
1.	Workers are always more committed to duty if they know that employers care for their welfare	189 (41.4)	219 (47.8)	20 (4.4)	18 (3.9)	11 (2.4)	457 (100)

2	No matter how lucrative schedule of duties are, workers depend wholly on wages and salaries	201 (44.0)	220 (48.1)	15 (3.3)	11 (2.4)	10 (2.2)	457 (100)
3	Industrial actions most times are engineered by disgruntled politicians	211 (46.2)	215 (47.0)	19 (4.2)	8 (1.8)	4 (0.9)	457 (100)
4	Sometimes, government prefer to give bribe to a few labour leaders than pay wage increase	215 (47.0)	220 (48.1)	10 (2.2)	4 (0.9)	8 (1.8)	457 (100)
5	Inadequate wages and salaries paid to workers is what gives rise to corrupt practices in civil service	199 (43.5)	225 (49.2)	9 (2.0)	12 (2.6)	12 (2.6)	457 (100)
6	State civil servants should be paid the salary with their federal counterpart	211 (46.2)	218 (47.7)	10 (2.2)	10 (2.2)	8 (1.8)	457 (100)
7	Lack of motivation gives room for inefficiency and poor performance	216 (47.3)	201 (44.0)	16 (3.5)	14 (3.1)	10 (2.2)	457 (100)
8	Most industrial actions on conditions of service are caused by government	218 (47.7)	224 (49.0)	5 (1.1)	7 (1.5)	3 (0.7)	457 (100)
9	Prompt implementation of pay rise will elicit positive work behaviours from works	200 (43.8)	205 (44.9)	21 (4.6)	20 (4.4)	11 (2.4)	457 (100)
10	Harmonious relationship between labour and government leads to increased productivity	210 (46.0)	219 (47.9)	12 (2.6)	9 (2.0)	7 (1.5)	457 (100)
	TOTAL	2070	2166	137	113	84	4570
	PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL	(45.3)	(47.4)	(3.0)	(2.3)	(1.8)	(100)

Note: Figures in parenthesis are percentages.

The analysis of the research questions presented in Table 2 shows that on the average, about 45.3% of the respondents strongly agreed with the statement of the items, 47.4% merely agreed, 3.0% disagreed, 2.3% strongly disagreed and 1.8% had no opinion thus showing that about 92.7% on the whole agreed with the item. Highlights of the item include the need for government to take the issue of workers welfare serious, the importance of wages and salaries to the employees, the position relationship between poor wages administration and corrupt practices in the public service as well as the effect of lack of motivation on employees' performance.

Research Question Two:

This research questions want to find out what the constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by the state government are. The opinions of the respondents on the issue are presented in Table 3.

Table 3: Mean Rating of the Respondents Perceived Constraints to full Implementation of Minimum Wage.

S/N	ITEM	Schedule Staff			Unschedule Staff		
		X1	SD1	Decision	X2	SD2	Decision
1.	Government lean resources is responsible for non-implementation of minimum wage	2.15	1.23	Disagree	2.01	0.18	Disagreed
2	Poor leadership is responsible for non-implementation of minimum wage	3.63	1.40	Agree	3.15	1.31	Agree
3	Corrupt practices hinders minimum wage implementation	3.68	1.49	Agree	3.66	1.33	Agree
4	Public funds are siphoned away by the leaders unnecessarily	4.60	1.77	Strongly Agree	3.82	1.40	Agreed
5	The over bloated size of the work force is a problem	3.74	1.56	Agree	3.62	1.42	Agree
6	Government uses public funds in settling political godfathers	4.10	1.66	Strongly Agree	4.20	1.73	Strongly Agree
7	State government hide under the cover of operating a federal system where minimum wage issue should not be binding on them	4.30	1.78	Strongly Agree	4.03	1.59	Strongly Agree
8	Minimum wage implementation by state government suffers because they are careless about the workers	4.10	1.67	Strongly Agree	4.00	1.69	Strongly Agree
9	The ghost worker syndrome is a serious drain on government finances	3.74	1.57	Agree	3.41	1.48	Agree
10	Politicians prefer to spend on activities that will guarantee their reelection than pay enhanced salaries and wages	3.95	1.70	Agree	3.67	1.54	Agree

Source: Filed Survey, 2015

X1 = 3.80; SD1 = 1.58; n1 = 320

X2 = 3.59; SD2= 1.37; n2= 137

The mean scores of the respondents presented in Table 3 above shows that the respondents disagreed with item 1 only. However, the scheduled staff in civil service strongly agreed with items 4, 6, 7 and 8, while unscheduled staff

in civil service strongly agreed with items 6, 7 and 8. Furthermore, both categories of the respondents merely agreed with the rest of the items. The issues raised in the items are the negative impact of government lean resources on the full implementation of minimum wage problem of weak leadership, corrupt practices and over bloated workforce among others.

Test of Hypothesis

The hypotheses formulated to guide the study were tested in this section using the chi-square (X^2) test of independence and t-test for independent sample of ($n \geq 30$). All tests were done at 0.05 level of significance.

Hypothesis One:

This hypothesis sought to determine whether there is any significant relationship between effective wages administration in civil service and employees' productivity. Accordingly, the null and alternative hypotheses were set as stated below:

Ho: There is no significant relationship between effective minimum wage administrations in civil service and employee's productivity.

H1: There is a significant relationship between effective minimum wage administration in civil service and employee's productivity.

To test the hypothesis, the data in Table 2 was analyzed using the said chi-square (X^2) inferential statistics. Summary of the result is presented below.

Table 4: Summary of Chi-square (X^2) Test for Hypothesis I

Variables	Sample Size (n)	Degree of freedom (df)	Chi-square X^2_{cal}	(x^2) Values X^2_{crit}	Significance level (α)	Decision Rule
Effective wage administration and employee productivity in civil service						
Respondents	557	36	97.162	43.773	0.05	Rejected

Note: X^2_{cal} means value of X^2 calculated and X^2_{crit} means the critical value of X^2 .

Decision Rule:

At 0.05 level of significance and 36 degrees of freedom (df), the calculated value of X^2 (97.162) is greater than the critical value (43.773). Consequently, null hypothesis which states that there is no significant relationship between effective minimum wage administration in civil service and employee's productivity was rejected while the

alternative which suggests significant relationship between effective minimum wage administrations in civil service and employee's productivity was accepted.

Hypothesis Two:

Hypothesis Two sought to determine whether there is any significant difference in the opinion of the respondents regarding what is perceived as the constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by some state governments. Accordingly, the null and alternative hypotheses were set as outlined below:

H₀: There is no significant difference in the opinion of the respondents regarding what they perceived as the constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by some state governments.

H₁: There is a significant difference between the opinions of the respondents regarding what they perceived as constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by state governments.

To the hypothesis, the data in Table 3 was used through the application of T-test for independent large sample of ($n \geq 30$). The level of significance is 0.05. The summary of the test result is presented in Table 5.

Table 5: Summary of T-Test Result for hypothesis II

Source of Variation	N	\bar{X}	SD	S(e)	Df	Cal.t	Crit.t	P<0.05
Scheduled Staff	320	3.80	1.58					
Unscheduled Staff	137	3.59	1.37	1.370	455	0.179	1.960	Not Significant

<<<<

N = 457; P < 0.05

Decision Rule:

The result of the t-test analysis presented in Table 5 shows that at 0.05 level of significance and 455 degrees of freedom, calculated t-value (0.179) is less than the critical t-value (1.960). Consequently, the null hypothesis which suggests that there is no significant difference in the opinion of the respondents regarding what they perceived as constraints to full implementation of minimum wage by state government was accepted.

4.1 Discussion of Research Results

In this section, all findings relating to this study were discussed. The study revealed that there exist strong relationship between effective wage administration and employee's productivity in Anambra State civil service as the result of the test of hypothesis has revealed in this section. This result is supported to a reasonable extent by the

finding of Tongo (2005) when he found in a related study that low productivity and inefficiency associated with public service can be removed if the civil servants are provided with some financial incentives. The opinion of the respondents is definite on the issue of wages and salaries administration in the state. The government has not been fair to workers and it borders more on poor leadership which manifests more insensitivity to their plight. The attitude of the government leaves much to be desired and this has affected the performance of the employees both individually and collectively.

The state has a history of poor government labour relations which still manifests in every attempt labour makes to ask for increase in wages and salaries. For instance talks on enhanced welfare package for the staff between workers representatives and government through joint negotiating council has always been dead locked to the detriment of workers. There is every evidence to suggest that government prefers to throw money around on activities that will facilitate re-election than improve the living conditions of the workers. The N18,000 minimum wage approved by the federal government since 2012 if eventually paid in the state is not even a reflection of real economic situation facing the workers. The equivalent of N18,000 in US dollar is only about US\$100 per month for the family and perhaps the extended family relations.

It is disheartening that before any salary adjustment is contemplated, so much undue publicity would have accompanied it such that while government is still saying it cannot pay the minimum wage, prices of goods and services would have hit the roof. Even if the government eventually gets away with the can't pay syndrome. Prices don't come down and it means further impoverishment of the workers. The study revealed also that the nature of wages administration in the state is partly responsible for corrupt practices, the workers engage on in the course of performing their duties. Therefore, as they struggle to survive, they engage on one unlawful activity or the other. There is also insecurity about what becomes of him/her when he/she must have left service if the lack of care can be this much even now that they are still in service. All this re-enforces the tendency to steal public fund if the opportunity comes.

Finally, it was revealed that what has existed between government and workers in the two faces of industrial relations is the negative aspect-conflict instead of cooperation. Though cooperation is what guarantees maximum output in any organization, it has never been exploited. But cooperating is a form of social interaction wherein two or more persons work together to achieve a common end. Thus, there is give and take and mutual interest leading to cooperation. Cooperation is joint or collaborative behaviour that is directed toward some goal and in which there is common interest or hope of reward. Such cordial cooperation has not been in existence between labour and government of Anambra State dating back to former Governor Mbadinuju's days in the state.

The second hypothesis of this study indicate that there is no significant difference in the opinion of the respondents regarding what they perceived as constraints to full implementations of minimum wage by some state governors. The study revealed specifically that rather than lack of funds as the government had always alleged, the real

problem is lack of will corruption. This finding is in line with what Olaleye (2012) found in his study of implications of non-implementation of minimum wage in Ekiti State. The study found that financial resources with which to implement the policy has never been the issue, rather the political will to implement the minimum wage policy has always been the problem coupled with the stealing that goes on within the government circle which has been a constant drain on public funds.

The study revealed also that the size of the workforce is unnecessarily over bloated to the extent that many employees whose names are in government payroll have no desks not talk of schedule of duty. Those employments are politically motivated so that it would look like the government is fulfilling their campaign promises. All over the world, or at least within the economics of the emerging markets, the governments have no serious business with direct employment rather it is the responsibility of the government to create enabling environment for the private sector to develop and give employment to people. The redundancy created by over bloated workforce has given room for low productivity and output in the sector.

5.1 Conclusion and Recommendations

Based on the findings made from the study we feel confident to make the following conclusions.

5.1.2 Conclusion

Wage administration is an aspect of industrial relations. It is one of the many areas of interaction between workers and government or employees and management. Therefore cordial relationship must exist between government and the workers for organizational goals to be realized. The civil servants in Anambra State are not paid living wages and as a result, many engage in other means of earning extra income for lively hood and sustenance. Poor salaries and wages contribute to corruption and un-productivities. Reasonable evidence exist in literature that adequate and regular salary are some of the motivational factors that civil servants need to be efficient and productive. Unfortunately, experience from the field (respondent opinion) did not suggest that civil servant in the state are so encouraged. In fact inefficiency, unproductiveness and corrupt practices observable in the system were necessitated by poor wage administration within the period under study.

The excuse that non-implementation of minimum wage policy is as a result of government's learn resources is unfounded. Government has the capacity to implement the policy but the problem is weak leadership and misplacement of priority. Other problems leading to non-implementation of minimum wage are corruption, over bloated work force which leads to low productivity and lack of political will to improve condition of service for workers.

5.1.3 Recommendations

Based on the findings and conclusion made from this study, the following recommendations were made:

The government should endeavour to identify the needs of the worker and address them promptly so that the employee can be at their best all the times. This is in line with Maslow's theory of Hierarchy of needs, human beings have many needs that are different in nature, ranging from biological need at lower level to psychological need at the upper level.

The success or failure of any government is a function of its relationship with the employees. In the light of this, the government should give priority to the welfare of those in its employment because they can make or move government programmes.

Wages administration in the state should be seen as a very serious issue by the government. In fact, government should set-up a standing-committee for salaries and wages review at regular intervals of not more than five years. This will take care of effect of inflation on workers salary and as well reflect the real economic realities in the economy.

The government should maintain optimal size of workforce. This they can do by stopping the politically motivated employment which has encouraged redundancy and low productivity. Instead, the government should pay unemployment allowance to the unemployed while creating enabling environment for the private sector to thrive and give employment to the people.

Finally, government should always enhance the salary of civil servants so that their take-home pay can provide at least their basic needs so as to dissuade the few corrupt ones from engaging on sharp practices as a result of insecurity arising from such inadequate salary. It is believed that the nonchalance and laxity currently being observed among some civil servants is as a result of loss of confidence in the government to fulfill its own part of the contract of employment between it and its employees.

REFERENCES

- Achebe, C. (1983). *The Trouble with Nigeria*, Enugu: Fourth Dimension Publishers Ltd.
- Alderfer, C.P. (1972); *Existence, Relatedness and Growth, Human Needs in Organizational setting*. New York: Free Press.
- Adobayo, A (2004). *Principles and Practice of Public Administration in Nigeria*: Ibadan: Spectrum Books Ltd.
- Banjoko, S (2006). *Managing Corporate Reward Systems*, Lagos: Pumark Nigeria Limited.
- Bass, B. M. (1981). *Strogdills Handbook of leadership* (rev and enlarged edition) New York: Free Press.
- Borg, W. R & Gall, M.B (1973) *Educational Research: An Introduction*. New York: David Mckay Co-In c.
- Drucker, P. (1974). *Management: Task, Responsibilities, Practices*, London: Heinemann.
- Egbo, E.A and Okeke, I.M. (2009). *Foundations of Personal Management in Nigeria*, Enugu: Bismark Publications.

- Ezulike, A. (2001). Evaluating Productivity level in Nigeria Civil: A case Study of Imo State, Unpublished Postgraduate Thesis, Calabar: University of Calabar.
- Iheriohanma. E. (2006) . Perceiving workers Interest in Participatory Management: Issues and Challenges, International Journal of Social Sciences. Vol. 5:113-129.
- Ipinlaiye, O. (2001). The Nigerian Civil Service: An insider's View in Omotoso, F, (ed.) Contemporary Issues in Public Administration, Lagos: Bolaby Publications.
- Kotter, JP. (1990), what Leaders Really Do, Harvard Business Review, March-April
- Lawal. T and Oluwatoyin, A. (2011). The Civil Service and Sustainable Development in Nigeria. Journal of sustainable Development in Africa, Vol 13, No 4: 385-393.
- Mbogu. G (2001). Implications of leadership styles of Administrators on Job Performance in Two Selected Organizations in Owerri, Imo State. Unpublished Thesis. Calabar: University of Calabar.
- Manadher, N. (2005) Intrinsic Problem with Corruption Studies available at www.siv.g.org/index.php/columnists...andarchive.org/details/corruptin nepa.
- Martocchio, J (2006); Strategic Compensation. A Human Resource Management Approach, New Jersey: prentice Hall.
- Maslow, A (1970), Motivation and Personality (2nd ed.). new York: Harper and Row.
- Nwachukwu, C.C. (2009); *Human Resource Management*, Port Harcourt: Davidstones Publishers Ltd.
- Nwana, O.C. (1981). Introduction to Educational Research, Ibadan: Heinemann Educational Books Plc.
- Nwokolo, J.I. (2011). Minimum Wage Strike in Anambra State: *The Real Story the Nation*, Lagos: Vintage Press Ltd
- Obiorah, C. A (2012). Wages Administration and Civil Services Productivity in Anambra State: An empirical Analysis.
- Olaleye, A. O. (2012). Implications of Non- Implementation of Minimum Wage in Ekiti State. Journal of Sustainable Development in Africa Volume 16, No, 2:121-129.
- Perry, J.F. Mesch, D., and Pearlberg, L. (2006), Motivating Employees in a New Governance Era. The performance Paradigm Revisited. Public Administration Review, 66 (4): 504-14, (online) Available: <http://www.aspanet.org.script content/ custom script content/12 downloads Perry Article htm> September 22, 2008.
- Perry, J.I (2009) Back to the future> Performance Related-Pay, Empirical Research, and the perils of resistance Public Administration Review, 69 (1): 33-51.
- Reilly, P. (2003); New Approaches in Reward. Their Relevance to the Public Sector, Public Money and Management, Vol 23, No 4: 245-352
- Tannenbaum, R and Warren, H.S (1983). How to choose a Leadership Pattern. Harvard Business Review, March-April.
- Tongo, C.I. (2005) . Public Service Motivation in Edo State of Nigeria, in wither Nigeria (4th General Assembly Proceedings), Social science Academy of Nigeria, 188-198 pp.